

Exhibit G

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8 JANET SIHLER, et al.,

9 Plaintiffs,

10 v.

11 GLOBAL E-TRADING, LLC DBA
12 CHARGEBACKS911, et al.

13 Defendants.

14 Proceedings in the United States District Court

15 Civil Action No.: 8:23-cv-01450-VMC-UAM

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
**MICROSOFT CORPORATION'S
OBJECTIONS TO SUBPOENA TO
PRODUCE DOCUMENTS,
INFORMATION, OR OBJECTS OR TO
PERMIT INSPECTION OF PREMISES IN
A CIVIL ACTION**

24 Pursuant to Rule 45 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, nonparty Microsoft
25 Corporation ("Microsoft") makes the following objections to the subpoena from Janet Sihler
26 and Charlene Bavencoff ("Plaintiffs") in the above-referenced matter. Microsoft's objections
and responses are based on its investigation to date. Microsoft expressly reserves the right to
modify and supplement these objections and responses if additional information or documents
are located by Microsoft. Microsoft assumes no obligation to supplement its responses, beyond
those permitted by applicable court rules, if any. To the extent that a meet and confer regarding
any of these objections is necessary, please contact undersigned counsel.

27
I. GENERAL OBJECTIONS

28
29
30
31
32
33
1. Improper Subpoena. Microsoft objects to the subpoena because it fails to state
the court from which it was issued. *See Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(a)(1)(A)(i).* Microsoft also objects to

1 the subpoena because it fails to identify the issuing party. *See Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(a)(3).* Failure
 2 to do so renders the subpoena invalid.

3 **2. Washington Shield Law.** Microsoft objects to the subpoena to the extent it
 4 seeks records or information that Microsoft is barred from producing under [Engrossed](#)
 5 [Substitute House Bill 1469, 2023 Reg. Sess. \(Wash. 2023\)](#) (the “Shield Law”). *See also* RCW
 6 5.51.020. To comply with the requirements of the Shield law you must attest under penalty of
 7 perjury that you are not seeking documents, information, testimony, or other assistance relating
 8 to an investigation into, or the enforcement of, a law that asserts criminal or civil liability for
 9 the provision, receipt, attempted provision or receipt, assistance in provision or receipt, or
 10 attempted assistance in the provision or receipt of protected health care services that are lawful
 11 in the state of Washington.

12 **3. Subscriber Notification.** Upon proper service of a nonparty subpoena seeking
 13 business records, Microsoft implements basic procedures to attempt to locate and preserve the
 14 information sought. If the subpoena requests subscriber information, Internet Protocol address
 15 history logs, or similar associated data (collectively “Subscriber Data”), pursuant to industry
 16 standard and court-approved practice, after locating the account and preserving the responsive
 17 data, Microsoft notifies the subscriber of the subpoena and permits the subscriber a 14-day
 18 period during which the subscriber may formally challenge or otherwise limit the subpoena
 19 requests by making an appropriate motion before the relevant court. Upon expiration of the 14-
 20 day waiting period, if the subscriber has failed to take timely action and if there are no valid
 21 reasons for Microsoft to object to the subpoena, Subscriber Data, if available, is typically
 22 produced, along with a document certifying its authenticity.

23 Following internal review and processing procedures, Microsoft initiates the processes
 24 necessary to locate and preserve the data requested and, where active accounts are identified,
 25 attempts to notify the subscriber(s) of your Subpoena and of the 14-day period to take
 26 appropriate court action.

1 **4. Preservation of Content.** When content data is requested, Microsoft
 2 implements measures to electronically preserve content data pending pursuit of a court order or
 3 account holder consent. However, given the frailty of electronic data, Microsoft cannot
 4 guarantee that no data will be lost as a natural function of standard retrieval and preservation
 5 processes. Further, please note that Microsoft cannot preserve the data indefinitely in
 6 anticipation of further action. Unless Microsoft receives written notification of intent to pursue
 7 account holder consent for content data within 45 days of the date of this letter, Microsoft may
 8 permit the electronic mail content data preserved in response to your request to be deleted as a
 9 function of routine document maintenance.

10 As Microsoft is not a party to this matter and has no interest in its outcome, it is neither
 11 Microsoft's intent, nor its desire, to hinder or delay production of the documents requested by
 12 you. Microsoft has implemented the procedural requirements noted above in order to conform
 13 with what it believes to be proper under applicable local, state, and federal laws and public
 14 policies.

15 **5. Explanation of Inactive And NSU Status Determinations.** Typically all
 16 email content and Internet Protocol Log data associated with accounts that are affirmatively
 17 closed by their account holders, or with accounts that are left inactive for approximately 270
 18 days, are permanently deleted. The remaining "shell" account containing only the registration
 19 information provided by the subscriber is labeled "inactive." After an additional 95 days, the
 20 shell account is also permanently deleted, and the email address returned to the pool of
 21 available addresses.

22 **6. Deleted Messages.** Please be advised that contrary to what appears to be a
 23 popular conception, Microsoft does not maintain comprehensive archives of content sent from
 24 or received by any of its Skype, Outlook, MSN, or Hotmail service accounts. All
 25 communication content possessed by Microsoft with regard to any given user account consists
 26 only of those emails, messages, or recordings accessible to the account holder. Microsoft does
 27 not maintain a database of deleted emails, messages, recordings or audio.

1 **7. Contrary to the Electronic Communications Privacy Act.** Microsoft objects
 2 to the subpoena to the extent it seeks communications protected from disclosure by the
 3 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”), 18 U.S.C. §2510 to §2711, which prohibits
 4 the disclosure of communication data in electronic storage without the consent of the account
 5 holder. Microsoft falls within either the definition of a “person or entity providing an
 6 electronic communication service to the public” or “a person or entity providing remote
 7 computing service to the public.” 18 U.S.C. §2702(a), (b). The ECPA allows entities that
 8 provide electronic communication or remote computing services to the public to divulging
 9 communication data in electronic storage only in the case of the exemptions in 18 U.S.C.
 10 §2702(b). None of these exemptions appear to be applicable in this case. The exemptions
 11 under 18 U.S.C. §2702(b) do not authorize disclosure of electronic communications even in
 12 response to a civil subpoena or even a court order. The unauthorized disclosure of such content
 13 could subject Microsoft and you to serious civil and criminal penalties. 18 U.S.C. §2707.

14 We are not aware of any controlling authority holding that services such as Microsoft’s
 15 Services are permitted by the ECPA to disclose communication data in electronic storage in
 16 response to a civil subpoena. To the contrary, courts have ruled that contents of
 17 communications may not be disclosed to civil litigants even when presented with a civil
 18 subpoena. *O’Grady v. Superior Court*, 139 Cal.App.4th 1423, 1448 (Cal. App. 2006); *accord*
 19 The U.S. Internet Service Provider Association, Electronic Evidence Compliance—A Guide for
 20 Internet Service Providers, 18 BERKELEY TECH. L. J. 945, 965 (2003) ([No Stored
 21 Communications Act provision] “permits disclosure pursuant to a civil discovery order unless
 22 the order is obtained by a government entity. ... [T]he federal prohibition against divulging
 23 communication data remains stark, and there is no obvious exception for a civil discovery order
 24 on behalf of a private party.”); *see also Federal Trade Comm’n v. Netscape Communications*
 25 *Corp.*, 196 F.R.D. 559, 561 (N.D. Cal. 2000) (“There is no reason for the court to believe that
 26 Congress could not have specifically included discovery subpoenas in the statute had it meant
 27 to.”); *In re Subpoena Duces Tecum to AOL, LLC*, 550 F.Supp.2d 606 (E.D. Va. 2008)

1 ("Agreeing with the reasoning in O'Grady, this Court holds that State Farm's subpoena may not
 2 be enforced consistent with the plain language of the Privacy Act because the exceptions
 3 enumerated in § 2702(b) do not include civil discovery subpoenas."); *J.T. Shannon Lumber*
 4 *Co., Inc. v. Gilco Lumber Inc.*, 2008 WL 4755370 (N.D. Miss. 2008) (holding there is no
 5 "exception to the [SCA] for civil discovery or allow for coercion of defendants to allow such
 6 disclosure."); *Viacom Intern. Inc. v. Youtube Inc.*, 253 F.R.D. 256 (S.D.N.Y. 2008) ("ECPA §
 7 2702 contains no exception for disclosure of [the content of] communications pursuant to civil
 8 discovery requests.")

9 As you can understand, given the severity of the penalties under the ECPA, we cannot
 10 release email content in response to your subpoena without firm assurance that the
 11 requirements of the ECPA are met. Therefore, until we are provided with the valid, written
 12 consent of the account holder(s), we must object.

13 **8. Objection to Production of Material Subject to Foreign Data Privacy Law.**

14 Microsoft objects to the production of information sought by your subpoena to the extent it is
 15 subject to foreign data privacy laws. This includes without limitation EU Regulation 2016/679,
 16 the General Data Protection Regulation ("GDPR") or EU General Data Protection Regulation
 17 (Regulation (EU) 2016/679) as amended and transposed into the laws of the United Kingdom
 18 pursuant to the European Union (Withdrawal) Act 2018 and the European Union (Withdrawal
 19 Agreement) Act 2020 ("UK GDPR"), or other foreign data privacy laws that might apply.

20 Microsoft is determining whether the data sought by your subpoena is subject to any such law;
 21 the process for making this determination takes approximately two weeks. Subject to, and
 22 without waiver of this objection, Microsoft may produce information responsive to your
 23 subpoena or that Microsoft determines is not subject to any such law and/or with the valid
 24 consent of the account holder.

25 **9. Electronically Stored Information.** Microsoft objects to the subpoena to the
 26 extent it seeks production of electronically stored information from sources not reasonably
 27 accessible (e.g., legacy systems, backup media, temporary or ambient data), in light of the bur-

1 dens or costs required to locate, restore, review, and produce whatever responsive information
 2 may be found. Known, difficult-to-access sources that may contain potentially responsive in-
 3 formation (others may exist and become apparent once the scope of the information sought by
 4 the Subpoena is properly defined), but which Microsoft is neither searching nor producing be-
 5 cause they are not reasonably accessible without undue burden, fall under the categories set out
 6 below: current disaster recovery media, obsolete back up media, legacy systems, sources
 7 requiring computer forensics to access, databases that are structured to hold or report
 8 information in certain formats and which cannot readily provide different data or data in
 9 different configurations, and source code. Microsoft is not able to retrieve information from
 10 many of these sources, or even confirm with certainty whether any responsive information in
 11 fact exists on the sources, without incurring substantial undue burden or cost.

12 **10. Failure to Reduce Burden on Nonparty.** Microsoft objects to the subpoena
 13 for failing to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft. *See* Federal
 14 Rule of Civil Procedure 45(d)(1). In particular, Microsoft objects to the subpoena to the extent
 15 certain information sought is in the possession, custody, or control of the parties to the
 16 litigation. *See e.g., Rembrandt Patent Innovations v. Apple, Inc.*, 2015 WL 4393581, at *2
 17 (W.D. Tex. July 15, 2015) (holding subpoena issued to non-party is unduly burdensome “until
 18 and unless Plaintiffs can establish they are unable to obtain the requested information from the
 19 Defendant”); *In re Allergan*, 2016 WL 5922717, at *9 (C.D. Cal. Sept. 23, 2016) (““Courts are
 20 particularly reluctant to require a non-party to provide discovery that can be produced by a
 21 party”” (citation omitted)); *Nidec Corp. v. Victor Co. of Japan*, 249 F.R.D. 575, 577 (N.D. Cal.
 22 2007) (“There is simply no reason to burden nonparties when the documents sought are in
 23 possession of the party defendant.”); *Moon v. SCP Pool Corp.* 232 F.R.D. 633, 638 (C.D. Cal.
 24 2005) (“[T]hese requests all pertain to defendant, who is a party, and, thus, plaintiffs can more
 25 easily and inexpensively obtain the documents from defendant, rather than from [the]
 26 nonparty””) (citing *Dart Indus. Co. v. Westwood Chem. Co.*, 649 F.2d 646, 649 (9th Cir.
 27 1980))); *Haworth, Inc. v. Herman Miller, Inc.*, 998 F.2d 975, 978 (Fed. Cir. 1993) (affirming

1 denial of motion to compel production from nonparty, holding “the district court could properly
 2 require [defendant] to seek discovery from its party opponent before burdening the nonparty []
 3 with [an] ancillary proceeding”). Obtaining records from a party also allows the parties to the
 4 litigation to directly address any confidentiality and privacy issues.

5 **11. Timing of Compliance.** Microsoft requires approximately eight weeks to
 6 process new requests for Subscriber Data. Accordingly, we ask that you extend the deadline of
 7 your subpoena to permit Microsoft to properly comply with its internal procedures. In the
 8 event that you do not agree, we must object to your subpoenas on the ground that it does not
 9 permit a reasonable time for response.

10 **12. Prepayment of Costs.** Microsoft requires the prepayment of its reasonable
 11 costs of complying with your subpoena before the production of documents. If prepayment is
 12 not remitted, Microsoft reserves the right to object to your subpoena and withhold the
 13 production of documents on the ground that the request is unduly costly and burdensome to
 14 Microsoft. Microsoft’s third-party fee schedule is available upon request.

15 **13. Reservation of Rights.** These objections apply to each request in the subpoena.
 16 Microsoft reserves its right to supplement, amend, correct, or modify its responses herein.

17 **II. RESPONSES AND OBJECTIONS TO REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION**

18 Microsoft incorporates the above objections in their entirety into each specific objection
 19 below. Microsoft’s specific objections are made for purposes of clarity and emphasis.
 20 Microsoft does not waive its above objections with respect to any of the subpoena’s requests
 21 below. Microsoft will not produce documents without (1) prepayment of Microsoft’s
 22 reasonable costs for complying with the subpoena; and (2) an attestation that complies with
 23 Washington’s Shield Law.

24 Microsoft objects to these requests for failing to take reasonable efforts to reduce the
 25 burden on nonparty Microsoft. *See* Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 45(d)(1). In particular,
 26

1 Microsoft objects to these requests to the extent the information sought is in the possession,
2 custody, or control of the account holder(s).

3 **REQUEST NO. 1:**

4 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
5 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
6 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—and the Skype user Nicholas Carroll or the Skype
7 account "n.carroll_6" from January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2023.

8 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 1:**

9 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
10 xcellent.choice and n.carroll_6. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that
11 are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a
12 disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
13 "documents," "David Flynn," and "Skype user Nicholas Caroll" are vague and ambiguous; (2)
14 it seeks information more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders;
15 (3) it fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the
16 requests for "David Flynn," and "Nicholas Carroll" fail to provide valid identifiers, clarifying
17 definitions or information necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft
18 cannot search for customer records by name, business name, or keyword.

21 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
22 Electronic Communications Privacy Act ("ECPA") without first obtaining consent from the
23 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
24 **absent verified account holder consent.**

25 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

26 **REQUEST NO. 2:**

1 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
 2 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
 3 "xcellent.choice"—i. e., David Flynn—and the Skype user Johnny DeLuca from January 1,
 4 2019 through December 31, 2023.

5 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 2:**

6 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype
 7 account(s): xcellent.choice. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that are
 8 not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a disproportionate
 9 and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases "documents," "David
 10 Flynn," and "Skype user Johnny DeLuca" are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information
 11 more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take
 12 reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the requests for "David
 13 Flynn," and "Johnny DeLuca" fail to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or
 14 information necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search
 15 for customer records by name, business name, or keyword.

16 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
 17 Electronic Communications Privacy Act ("ECPA") without first obtaining consent from the
 18 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
 19 **absent verified account holder consent.**

20 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

21 **REQUEST NO. 3:**

22 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
 23 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
 24 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—and the Skype user Benjamin Scrancher a/k/a Ben
 25

1 Scrancher or the Skype account "b.scrancher" from January 1, 2019 through December 31,
2 2023.

3 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 3:**

4 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
5 xcellent.choice and b.scrancher. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that
6 are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a
7 disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
8 "documents," "David Flynn," and "Skype user Benjamin Scrancher a/k/a Ben Scrancher" are
9 vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information more easily obtained from a party to the
10 litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on
11 nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the requests for "David Flynn," and "Benjamin Scrancher a/k/a
12 Ben Scrancher" fail to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information necessary
13 for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer records by
14 name, business name, or keyword.

15 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
16 Electronic Communications Privacy Act ("ECPA") without first obtaining consent from the
17 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
18 **absent verified account holder consent.**

19 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

20 **REQUEST NO. 4:**

21 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
22 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
23 "xcellent.choice"—i. e., David Flynn—and the Skype user Meghan O'Donnell or the Skype
24 account "m.odonnell_19" from January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2023.
25
26
27

1 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 4:**

2 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
 3 xcellent.choice and m.odonnell_19. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents
 4 that are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a
 5 disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
 6 “documents,” “David Flynn,” and “Skype user Meghan O’Donnell” are vague and ambiguous;
 7 (2) it seeks information more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account
 8 holders; (3) it fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and
 9 (4) the requests for “David Flynn,” and “Meghan O’Donnell” fail to provide valid identifiers,
 10 clarifying definitions or information necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search.
 11
 12 Microsoft cannot search for customer records by name, business name, or keyword.

13 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
 14 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
 15 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
 16 **absent verified account holder consent.**

17 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

18 **REQUEST NO. 5:**

19 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
 20 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
 21 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—and the Skype account "m.jacula" from January 1, 2019
 22 through December 31, 2023.

24 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 5:**

25 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
 26 xcellent.choice and m.jacula. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that
 27

1 are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a
 2 disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
 3 “documents,” and “David Flynn” are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information more
 4 easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take
 5 reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the request for “David
 6 Flynn” fails to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information necessary for
 7 Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer records by
 8 name, business name, or keyword.

9
 10 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
 11 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
 12 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
 13 **absent verified account holder consent.**

14 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

15 **REQUEST NO. 6:**

16 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
 17 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
 18 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—and the Skype user Melissa Flipski or the Skype account
 19 "melflipski" from January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2023.

20 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 6:**

21 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
 22 xcellent.choice and melflipski. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that
 23 are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a
 24 disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
 25 “documents,” “David Flynn,” and “Skype user Melissa Flipski” are vague and ambiguous; (2)

1 it seeks information more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders;
 2 (3) it fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the
 3 requests for “David Flynn,” and “Melissa Flipski” fail to provide valid identifiers, clarifying
 4 definitions or information necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft
 5 cannot search for customer records by name, business name, or keyword.

6 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
 7 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
 8 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
 9 **absent verified account holder consent.**

10 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

11 **REQUEST NO. 7:**

12 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
 13 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
 14 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—and the Skype user Gary Cardone or the Skype account
 15 "gcardonel" from January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2023.

16 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 7:**

17 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
 18 xcellent.choice and gcardonel. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that
 19 are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a
 20 disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
 21 “documents,” “David Flynn,” and “Skype user Gary Cardone” are vague and ambiguous; (2) it
 22 seeks information more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3)
 23 it fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the
 24 requests for “David Flynn,” and “Gary Cardone” fail to provide valid identifiers, clarifying
 25 requests for “David Flynn,” and “Gary Cardone” fail to provide valid identifiers, clarifying
 26

1 definitions or information necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft
2 cannot search for customer records by name, business name, or keyword.

3 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
4 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
5 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
6 **absent verified account holder consent.**

7 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.
8

9 **REQUEST NO. 8:**

10 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
11 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
12 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn and the Skype account(s) for subscriber Monica Eaton
13 a/k/a Monica Cardone from January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2023.

14 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 8:**

15 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype
16 account(s): xcellent.choice. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that are
17 not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a disproportionate
18 and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases “documents,” “David
19 Flynn,” and “Skype account(s) for subscriber Monica Eaton a/k/a Monica Cardone” are vague
20 and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or
21 the account holders; (3) it fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty
22 Microsoft; and (4) the requests for “David Flynn,” and “Skype account(s) for subscriber
23 Monica Eaton a/k/a Monica Cardone” fail to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or
24 information necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search
25 for customer records by name, business name, or keyword.
26

1 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
2 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
3 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
4 **absent verified account holder consent.**

5 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

6 **REQUEST NO. 9:**

7 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
8 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
9 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—and the Skype user Anthony Pugliese or the Skype
10 account "apugliese_12" from January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2023.
11

12 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 9:**

13 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
14 xcellent.choice and apugliese_12. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents
15 that are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a
16 disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
17 “documents,” “David Flynn,” and “Skype user Anthony Pugliese” are vague and ambiguous;
18 (2) it seeks information more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account
19 holders; (3) it fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and
20 (4) the requests for “David Flynn,” and “Anthony Pugliese” fail to provide valid identifiers,
21 clarifying definitions or information necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search.
22 Microsoft cannot search for customer records by name, business name, or keyword.
23

24 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
25 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
26
27

1 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
2 **absent verified account holder consent.**

3 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

4 **REQUEST NO. 10:**

5 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
6 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
7 "xcellent.choice"—i. e., David Flynn—and the Skype user Brandon Figueroa or the Skype
8 account "brandontfigueroa" from January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2023.
9

10 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 10:**

11 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
12 xcellent.choice and brandontfigueroa. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks
13 documents that are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places
14 a disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
15 "documents," "David Flynn," and "Skype user Brandon Figueroa" are vague and ambiguous;
16 (2) it seeks information more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account
17 holders; (3) it fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and
18 (4) the requests for "David Flynn," and "Brandon Figueroa" fail to provide valid identifiers,
19 clarifying definitions or information necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search.
20 Microsoft cannot search for customer records by name, business name, or keyword.
21

22 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
23 Electronic Communications Privacy Act ("ECPA") without first obtaining consent from the
24 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
25 **absent verified account holder consent.**

26 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.
27

REQUEST NO. 11:

Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—and the Skype user Aurora Marshall or the Skype account "a_marshall_24" from January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2023.

RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 11:

Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts: xcellent.choice and a_marshall_24. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases "documents," "David Flynn," and "Skype user Aurora Marshall" are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the requests for "David Flynn," and "Aurora Marshall" fail to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer records by name, business name, or keyword.

Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the Electronic Communications Privacy Act ("ECPA") without first obtaining consent from the account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications absent verified account holder consent.**

Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

REQUEST NO. 12:

Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account

1 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—and the Skype account "instantlyfamous" from January
 2, 2019 through December 31, 2023.

3 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 12:**

4 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
 5 xcellent.choice and instantlyfamous. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents
 6 that are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a
 7 disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
 8 "documents," and "David Flynn" are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information more
 9 easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take
 10 reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the request for "David
 11 Flynn" fails to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information necessary for
 12 Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer records by
 13 name, business name, or keyword.

14 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
 15 Electronic Communications Privacy Act ("ECPA") without first obtaining consent from the
 16 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
 17 **absent verified account holder consent.**

18 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

19 **REQUEST NO. 13:**

20 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
 21 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
 22 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—and the Skype account "threecommaclub" from January
 23 1, 2019 through December 31, 2023.

24 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 13:**

1 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
 2 xcellent.choice and threecommaclub. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks
 3 documents that are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places
 4 a disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
 5 “documents,” and “David Flynn” are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information more
 6 easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take
 7 reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the request for “David
 8 Flynn” fails to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information necessary for
 9 Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer records by
 10 name, business name, or keyword.

12 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
 13 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
 14 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
 15 **absent verified account holder consent.**

16 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

17 **REQUEST NO. 14:**

18 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
 19 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
 20 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—and the Skype account "thebigguy1978_1" from January
 21 1, 2019 through December 31, 2023.

23 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 14:**

24 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype accounts:
 25 xcellent.choice and thebigguy1978_1. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks
 26 documents that are not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places
 27

1 a disproportionate and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases
 2 “documents,” and “David Flynn” are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information more
 3 easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take
 4 reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the request for “David
 5 Flynn” fails to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information necessary for
 6 Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer records by
 7 name, business name, or keyword.

8 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
 9 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
 10 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
 11 **absent verified account holder consent.**

13 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

14 **REQUEST NO. 15:**

15 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
 16 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
 17 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—relating to MSwipe Americas from January 1, 2019
 18 through December 31, 2023.

20 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 15:**

21 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype
 22 account(s): xcellent.choice. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that are
 23 not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a disproportionate
 24 and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases “documents,” “David
 25 Flynn,” and “relating to MSwipe Americas” are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information
 26 more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take

1 reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the request for “David
 2 Flynn” fails to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information necessary for
 3 Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer records by
 4 name, business name, or keyword.

5 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
 6 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
 7 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
 8 **absent verified account holder consent.**

9 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

10 **REQUEST NO. 16:**

11 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
 12 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
 13 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—relating to Brightree Holdings from January 1, 2019
 14 through December 31, 2023.

15 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 16:**

16 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype
 17 account(s): xcellent.choice. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that are
 18 not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a disproportionate
 19 and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases “documents,” “David
 20 Flynn,” and “relating to Brightree Holdings” are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information
 21 more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take
 22 reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the request for “David
 23 Flynn” fails to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information necessary for
 24

1 Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer records by
2 name, business name, or keyword.

3 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
4 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
5 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
6 **absent verified account holder consent.**

7 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.
8

9 **REQUEST NO. 17:**

10 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
11 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
12 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—relating to Beyond Global, Inc. from January 1, 2019
13 through December 31, 2023.

14 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 17:**

15 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype
16 account(s): xcellent.choice. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that are
17 not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a disproportionate
18 and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases “documents,” “David
19 Flynn,” and “relating to Beyond Global, Inc” are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information
20 more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take
21 reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the request for “David
22 Flynn” fails to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information necessary for
23 Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer records by
24 name, business name, or keyword.
25
26
27

1 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
 2 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
 3 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
 4 **absent verified account holder consent.**

5 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

6 **REQUEST NO. 18:**

7 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
 8 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
 9 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—relating to BMOR Global, LLC from January 1, 2019
 10 through December 31, 2023.

11 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 18:**

12 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype
 13 account(s): xcellent.choice. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that are
 14 not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a disproportionate
 15 and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases “documents,” “David
 16 Flynn,” and “relating to BMOR Global, LLC” are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks
 17 information more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it
 18 fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the request
 19 for “David Flynn” fails to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information
 20 necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer
 21 records by name, business name, or keyword.

22 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
 23 Electronic Communications Privacy Act (“ECPA”) without first obtaining consent from the
 24
 25
 26
 27

1 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
2 **absent verified account holder consent.**

3 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

4 **REQUEST NO. 19:**

5 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
6 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
7 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—relating to Blue Hat Marketing from January 1, 2019
8 through December 31, 2023.
9

10 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 19:**

11 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype
12 account(s): xcellent.choice. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that are
13 not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a disproportionate
14 and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases "documents," "David
15 Flynn," and "relating to Blue Hat Marketing" are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks
16 information more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it
17 fails to take reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the request
18 for "David Flynn" fails to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information
19 necessary for Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer
20 records by name, business name, or keyword.
21

22 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
23 Electronic Communications Privacy Act ("ECPA") without first obtaining consent from the
24 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
25 **absent verified account holder consent.**

26 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.
27

1 **REQUEST NO. 20:**

2 Copies of all Skype messages, documents, or communications between the account
3 "xcellent.choice" or any other Skype account associated with the subscriber for the account
4 "xcellent.choice"—i.e., David Flynn—relating to Chargebacks911 from January 1, 2019
5 through December 31, 2023.

6 **RESPONSE TO REQUEST NO. 20:**

7 Microsoft interprets this request as seeking content associated with the Skype
8 account(s): xcellent.choice. Microsoft objects to this request in that it seeks documents that are
9 not relevant, necessary, and proportional to the needs of the case and places a disproportionate
10 and undue burden on a third party because (1) the terms and phrases "documents," "David
11 Flynn," and "relating to Chargebacks911" are vague and ambiguous; (2) it seeks information
12 more easily obtained from a party to the litigation or the account holders; (3) it fails to take
13 reasonable efforts to reduce the burden on nonparty Microsoft; and (4) the request for "David
14 Flynn" fails to provide valid identifiers, clarifying definitions or information necessary for
15 Microsoft to conduct a reasonable search. Microsoft cannot search for customer records by
16 name, business name, or keyword.

17 Microsoft objects to this request as seeking content prohibited from disclosure by the
18 Electronic Communications Privacy Act ("ECPA") without first obtaining consent from the
19 account holder. **Microsoft will not produce the content of electronic communications**
20 **absent verified account holder consent.**

21
22 Microsoft will not produce documents in response to this request.

1 DATED this 12th day of July, 2024.

2
3 DAVIS WRIGHT TREMAINE LLP
4 Attorneys for Microsoft Corporation

5 By /s/ James Howard
6 James Howard, WSBA #37259
7 Lisa Southerland
8 920 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3300
9 Seattle, WA 98104-1610
10 Telephone: 202-973-4221
11 Email: LisaSoutherland@dwt.com

1
2 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**
3

4 I hereby certify that on July 12, 2024, I caused the foregoing document to be served by
5 electronic mail to the following recipient(s):
6

7 Kevin Kneupper
8 Kneupper & Covey PC
9 17011 Beach Blvd. Suite 900
10 Huntington Beach, CA 92647

11 kevin@kneuppervcovey.com

12 Addison Legal Services, LLC
13 2405 Evergreen Park Drive SW, Suite B-2
14 Olympia, WA 98052

15 serve@addisonlegal.com

16 DATED this 12th day of July, 2024.

17 DAVIS WRIGHT TREMAINE LLP
18 Attorneys for Microsoft Corporation

19 By /s/ James Howard
20 James Howard, WSBA #37259
21 Lisa Southerland
22 920 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3300
23 Seattle, WA 98104-1610
24 Telephone: 202-973-4221
25 Email: LisaSoutherland@dwt.com